

Retraction

The article “Indirect Interactions Shape Selection in a Multispecies Food Web,” published in the March 2019 issue (pp. 321–330) of *The American Naturalist*, is retracted by request of the authors of this statement. This article concerned the impact of a defoliating insect on the size and population density of a goldenrod stem gall and the subsequent influence of mature gall size on attack rates by the parasitoid wasps and predatory birds on the gall-making insect. The authors found several errors in their analyses and have provided a full reanalysis in an R code file, available online.

The main error occurred because observations that should have been excluded were accidentally retained, which biased the statistics on selection for gall size. Specifically, some gall-maker larvae die early in development, which not only halts gall growth but also removes those larvae from the pool of hosts/prey. Including such observations in the analysis distorts the relationship of natural enemy attack to mature gall size and the resulting influence of natural enemies on the selection of gall size. The authors’ previous studies of this relationship excluded such observations. Correcting this error in the current study yielded different selection gradients, such that linear selection no longer varied among treatments (interaction $P > .1$) but nonlinear selection did vary (interaction $P < .05$). Both of these changes to the statistical results altered inferences about the effects of indirect interactions on selection intensity.

There were also two errors in the calculation of how treatment effects influence gall makers. When the density of galls was reanalyzed with a more appropriate error distribution, the difference among treatments changed to marginally significant ($P = .086$). Similarly, mortality by *Eurytoma* was erroneously reported as $P < .001$, and reanalysis showed it to be only marginally significant ($P = .098$).

The extent of the altered results means that much of the discussion section in Start et al. is not valid. The authors of this statement are requesting a retraction of this article but plan to resubmit a thoroughly rewritten article that correctly reports and interprets the revised results.

BENJAMIN GILBERT and ARTHUR E. WEIS

Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Toronto,
25 Willcocks Street, Toronto, Ontario M5S3B2, Canada

Submitted June 4, 2021; Electronically published August 12, 2021
